



WWF Cymru - Delivering a One Planet Wales

Conference Report



New Government. New powers. Big opportunity for a One Planet Future

July 2011

CONTENTS

Foreword	3
Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development	
Executive Summary	4
Key messages from conference	5
Anne Meikle, Head of WWF Cymru	
Key challenges from the global climate context	6
Sir John Houghton FRS CBE	
Key challenges from the global resource scarcity context	8
Will Day	
The situation in Wales	9
Peter Davies, Commissioner for Sustainable Futures	
One Wales: One Planet: What progress has the Government made?	11
Dr Alan Netherwood, Netherwood Sustainable Futures	
New powers – the opportunity to deliver sustainable development	13
Peter Roderick	
Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development	14
John Griffiths AM	
Questions and Panel Discussion	15
Speakers' Biographies	17

Foreword



I am very pleased to welcome the publication of this conference report. The conference brought together a number of key stakeholders to consider progress towards a one planet Wales.

It is two years since we launched One Wales; One Planet, where we set out our aspiration to become a one planet nation within the lifetime of a generation. We are clear about the threat of climate change, and clear that this is the consequence of unsustainable development.

Sir John Houghton was right to remind the conference about the urgency of the need to reduce our greenhouse gas emissions. Will Day pointed to the broader issue of global scarcity in key resources, and the challenge this presents to us all. Peter Davies, our Commissioner for Sustainable Futures, was clear that sustainable development is the way to manage these challenges, and stressed the importance of tying in resource efficiency issues with social justice, equality, and the provision of economic opportunity for all.

Alan Netherwood has had a long, hard look at the progress we have made at embedding our one planet aspiration across the Welsh Government. He was clear about the policy areas where good progress has been made, and about where challenges still exist. This report provides us with an evidence base to inform the forthcoming statutory effectiveness review of our Sustainable Development Scheme. I am grateful to WWF Cymru for commissioning this work.

I very much look forward to working with all our stakeholders, who I know have a keen interest and support for our approach to sustainable development, as we undertake our effectiveness review. Your support, challenge, and active engagement remains vital as we continue on our journey to make real our aspirations to develop Wales as a truly sustainable nation.

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "John Griffiths".

John Griffiths, AM
Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development

Executive Summary

Wales has been through a great time of change recently, with a referendum on further powers and an election within a short space of time. Both of these important events present us with a real opportunity and possibilities for change in Wales. This is why we, at WWF Cymru, felt that we should hold a conference in the period soon after the election to establish a dialogue early on in the new Assembly on what Wales can do to reduce our impact on the environment and do our part to mitigate climate change.

As Sir John Houghton and Will Day outlined at the conference, we as a global community face the stark reality of climate change and resource scarcity in the near future. This is a reality based on thorough and robust research. They both emphasised the need to act urgently if we are to make a difference. Living within environmental limits is a prerequisite for sustainability and must be at the top of the agenda for all political parties in the Fourth Assembly.

We were particularly pleased at our conference to be able to launch a WWF Cymru commissioned report by Dr Alan Netherwood, [‘Progress in embedding the ‘One Planet’ aspiration in Welsh Government’](#). The research recognised the Government’s determination and leadership in establishing a vision of a One Planet, low carbon Wales. However, it also reveals inconsistent delivery of these aims by different Government departments. Dr Alan Netherwood rather aptly described the “tanker of Government” slowly changing course and turning onto a path of sustainable development. To stay on this path will require us as a nation to keep striving for change measured against longer term targets for footprint reduction.

The message was clear at our conference from both the speakers and the many organisations gathered to discuss with us the way forward – Wales has a unique opportunity to become a world leader by transforming Wales into a prosperous and sustainable nation. As Peter Davies, Commissioner for Sustainable Futures, told delegates, Wales can be truly proud of the landmark commitments set out in ‘One Wales: One Planet’. However, rhetoric must also be matched with real, practical action on the ground – right down to a local level in transport plans, recycling, and sustainable homes. Having set our target we must now focus on delivery to translate rhetoric into reality and to achieve the change we aspire to. This vision has so far put Wales at the forefront in the UK on sustainable development, but it will be all too easy to fall behind.

One way in which Wales’ unique opportunity presents itself is in the new legislative powers of the National Assembly for Wales, as highlighted by Peter Roderick. The opportunity is at hand to strengthen the duty on sustainable development, establishing robust governance structures to embed this as the central principle of Government and public sector and ensuring the rights of Welsh citizens. Therefore, WWF Cymru welcomes the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development’s commitment at our conference, to bring forward a Sustainable Development Bill, which could represent a golden opportunity to use Wales’ new powers in a historic and meaningful way. It is extremely encouraging that the Minister wishes to engage with organisations such as WWF Cymru to continue to shape Wales’ path towards becoming a sustainable nation. We look forward to working with the Government, the Assembly and other organisations in the coming months and years.

Key messages from conference



The contributors to this conference have ensured some clear messages for all of us in Wales, but particularly for the Welsh Government. I would summarise this as follows:

- The Welsh Government has set a clear ambition to become a One Planet Wales that is widely applauded. ***Let's live up to this vision and lead the way.***
- We must recognise the scale of the impact from our unsustainable consumption: competition for increasingly scarce resources of energy, water, food and metals will drive up prices and could lead to conflict and mass migration. ***We must live within environmental limits.***
- The five year period of this 4th Assembly is critical. ***It must deliver change to our economy and lifestyle.***
- There has been inconsistent delivery of actions to meet the One Planet goals, across government and we cannot be sure that the plans are sufficient to meet the goals. ***We must ensure we MIND THE GAP between rhetoric and reality.***
- New legislation offers the opportunity to make absolutely clear the Government's commitment to sustainable development, to living within environmental limits and providing robust governance systems which will ensure our access to environmental justice

Anne Meikle, Head of WWF Cymru

Sir John Houghton FRS CBE – Key challenges from the global climate context

Sir John Theodore Houghton FRS CBE is an eminent and highly respected scientist who was the co-chair of the Nobel Peace Prize winning Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change's (IPCC) scientific assessment working group and lead editor of the first three IPCC reports. He is currently Honorary Scientist of the Hadley Centre for Climate Prediction and Research at the Meteorological Office.

Opening the conference, Sir John Houghton outlined the context of global climate change and the challenges we face.

He explained the scientific base for the biggest challenge we face – human-induced climate change:

An increase in the carbon dioxide concentration in the atmosphere from around 280ppm that it had been for most of the last 10,000 years to nearly 400 ppm – an increase of over 40%, as a result of the burning of fossil fuels.

The '*greenhouse effect*' that has been known for over 200 years, where the carbon dioxide absorbs infrared or 'heat radiation' from the Earth's surface that acts as a blanket keeping it warmer than it would otherwise be.

Over the last 50 years or so the global average temperature has increased by well over half a degree Celsius – a rate of change that is well outside the range of normal variability.

Unless strong measures are taken to reduce emissions, the global temperature increase this century will likely reach between 3 and 6°C with a rate of change of climate greater than has occurred for many tens of thousands of years.

He outlined some of the impacts of the global average temperature change:

Sea level rise of on average half a metre by 2100 due to expansion of ocean water as it warms. In addition, the possible melting of glaciers and the polar ice caps could mean this approaches one metre in total by 2100.

Sir John said that this was a large change and will demand big increases in sea defences, especially for low lying areas. He gave the example of Bangladesh, where around 10 million people live and farm below the one metre contour. This will lead to tens of millions of environmental refugees.

Extremes of climate and an increase in the number of heatwaves. The heatwave in Europe in 2003 led to the premature deaths of 20,000 people.

Changes in the hydrological cycle will result in **more floods and more droughts**. Recent research into the likely increase in risk of floods and droughts over the next 50 years suggests increases of up to a factor of five.

Sir John highlighted that the evidence for these changes is based on the thorough work of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), which has produced four assessments in 1990, 1995, 2001 and 2007. These involved several thousand scientists drawn from many countries as contributors and reviewers covering science, impacts and analyses of policy options. No assessment on any other scientific topic has been so thoroughly researched and reviewed, and assessments were put through detailed scrutiny.

He said that all nations must prepare to adapt to the inevitable climate changes and all nations must also act to reduce emissions of greenhouse gases, especially carbon dioxide, as rapidly as possible to mitigate the amount of future climate change.

There is a strong moral obligation for us urgently to reduce our carbon emissions and also to use our wealth to help those in the poorer countries to develop sustainably, and Wales should lead this.

Commenting on the targets for emissions reductions that Wales has taken on, a 3 % reduction per year and 40 % below 1990 levels by 2020, he said that although they are tough targets he fears they are not adequate.

At the Copenhagen meeting of the International Climate Convention in December 2009, there was agreement that if all developed nations managed to achieve a 3% reduction per year target for emissions, there would be at best a 50% chance of reaching the 2°C target for global average temperature. There would remain a substantial risk of exceeding 4°C, bringing devastation on a scale that all agree must be avoided.

The emissions' reduction target for Wales therefore needs to average at least **4% or 5% per year**, which is achievable.

In addition, if the emissions associated with the manufacture of the growing influx of goods imported into the UK from China and India were attributed to the UK, they would add about an additional 20% to UK emissions. Sir John argued that the UK must accept its responsibility for generating these emissions.

There are two key areas where action is necessary; **energy efficient housing, and the creation of renewable energy from tides.**

As well as new housing being 'zero carbon', existing housing stock must be properly insulated and refurbished to high energy efficiency standards. The workforce required for this this would create employment opportunities, and the cost would be recovered from fuel savings.

There is a large potential for tidal energy in Wales. As well as proposals for a Severn barrage, there is potential for tidal energy from north Wales. There is an urgent need for thorough and careful study of all the options that have been proposed including appraisal of their environmental impact. The Welsh Government should strongly support these schemes and encourage business investors who are beginning to see the rewarding long term investments they could represent.



Will Day - Key challenges from the global resource scarcity context

Will Day is currently Sustainability Advisor to Pricewaterhouse Coopers, and as a Senior Associate of the University of Cambridge Programme for Sustainability Leadership (CPSL). He is Chairman of Water and Sanitation for the Urban Poor (WSUP), and has been a Special Advisor to the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) since 2004. He was previously Chair of the Sustainable Development Commission

Will Day outlined the implication of resource scarcity and the potential challenges that resource scarcity presents.

Water scarcity – If the availability of fresh water is plotted against population then extreme stress shows as the climate changes and population changes. Agriculture, the largest user of water, on the whole uses water inefficiently.

Water is wasted in homes, and growing cities are increasing water use. He highlighted that water is a very precious resource that is only starting to be recognised as such. In Yemen, the government is already moving people to the coast because of a lack of water. Just one part of China is using 4 billion litres more a year than is flowing.

Food scarcity – He questioned whether we would be able to feed a growing population, despite scientific successes in agriculture. Forests are destroyed, which results in losing soil. The amount of land per capita goes down inescapably.

Increased use of fertilisers and the increased use of science to escape pests in farming have led to a remarkable increase in the resistance of pests, and fertiliser washing into our water has damaged our fisheries and seas.

An increase in world temperature by 2°C will mean that produce such as coffee will not be able to be grown in areas such as Uganda, resulting in profound social implications.

Peak oil – Despite there being a plentiful oil supply, the world has passed the point of peak *easy* oil. There is no resource scarcity of coal but remaining sources sit underneath populated areas in India and the United States.

Metal scarcity is such that very soon it will be commercially viable to Hoover our city streets to recover the platinum from our exhausts. There is only enough copper to last 25 years and iron ore to last 60 or 65 years. It is not clear how long specialist metals that are in devices such as Blackberry will last.

There is lots of recycling – drinks firms are looking at the PET cycle and recycling to make sure that they do not have to buy another drop of oil.

He outlined the series of challenges the world faces; the fact that billions of people aspire to wealth, and questions over whether that is possible; higher prices because of resource scarcity.

There is a lack of vision for a sustainable earth, and politicians have the difficulty of leading people to what is perceived as a 'worse place'.

Will Day expressed his admiration for the work done in Wales so far, which he said had been achieved because Wales is a nation that has put sustainability at its heart. One Wales One Planet is unique, and Wales is likely to continue to lead the way.

Peter Davies – The situation in Wales

Peter Davies is Wales' first Sustainable Futures Commissioner following his appointment by the Welsh Government in April 2011, providing independent advice to the Welsh Government. This role is supported by Cynnal Cymru – Sustain Wales, the sustainable development forum for Wales. Peter also was appointed as independent chair of the Climate Change Commission for Wales in 2010.



Commissioner for Sustainable Development, Peter Davies, provided a snapshot of his perspective on sustainable development in Wales and spoke to delegates about the need to mind the gap between rhetoric and reality, and theory and practical action.

He began by congratulating WWF for commissioning the [‘Progress in embedding the ‘One Planet’ aspiration in Welsh Government’](#) report being launched.

He said that despite the fact that the UK Coalition Government aimed to be the ‘greenest government ever’, Wales has established the strongest leadership on sustainability in the UK.

He highlighted his own role as Commissioner for Sustainable Futures as an example of cross party agreement. He added that his role, supported by Cynnal Cymru, may be established on a legal footing in the future, which is an example of how we are thinking and responding differently in Wales. The rubric and procedures are there in Wales, and Wales has a distinctive brand.

The danger is **the gap between rhetoric and reality**, and the challenge is making it part of day-to-day life.

He expressed his pride in the progress made on waste and recycling. There have been iconic actions such as charging for single use carrier bags. This is a visible statement of Wales’ commitment.

He highlighted examples of progress in Wales; **cutting edge research** in Wales’ universities, and **eco schools** such as Green Hill Primary in Caerphilly.

Housing- Wales has set high aspirations, but if you look at efficiency figures for new homes in the last twelve months then England is performing better than Wales. Wales has the highest level of fuel poverty

and the poorest housing stock in the UK, with consequences for the health budget. We can be proud of Arbed, the first phase of which has transformed 6,000 homes.

In reality Wales' carbon emissions are higher proportionally than any other parts of the UK, due to our legacy. Many 'anchor companies' are high energy users. We must work with these businesses as part of the solution, not the problem.

Wales has strong statements about attracting low carbon industry, but he argued that he spoke to businesses who work to decrease emissions but do not get due reference when they go into tender.

Energy developers have figures demonstrating how much more it costs to develop renewable energy projects in Wales than in England. Wind developers feel that the Welsh Government set the policy in TAN 8 and then walked away.

There has been a **failure to take people with us**. There is a trust and confidence gap, which is the biggest impediment to achieving sustainable living. There is bottom up action and top down policy development – there is a gap between the reality on a community level and the policy document.

Wales has some of the poorest communities, and it is only because of the low emissions output of these communities that Wales is performing better than England and Scotland on sustainability.

Peter Davies said that the Sustainable Development Bill will hopefully allow the sustainability charter adopted by the Welsh Government to be applied across the public sector and outside Cardiff Bay. The test will be practical action, and it is critical to *act* our way into thinking differently.

He concluded by discussing his role as Chair of the Climate Change Commission for Wales. He highlighted that it is important, cross sector, and unique in having all political parties around the table. WWF's role will be critical in feeding into the Commission's annual report.



Dr Alan Netherwood - One Wales: One Planet: What progress has the Government made?

Dr. Alan Netherwood has been running his own company, Netherwood Sustainable Futures, for the past four years, working with a range of clients on sustainability and climate change initiatives.

Dr Alan Netherwood launched the WWF Cymru commissioned report, [‘Progress in embedding the ‘One Planet’ aspiration in Welsh Government?’](#)

The report concludes:

- Welsh Government has a good overall vision and has made good progress on the short term actions required.
- However, there is a lack of consistent application to achieve the goal of a One Planet Wales, both across government and in its advice to the public sector.
- There is no plan, with key milestones, driving cross-government action in meeting the One Planet goals. There is a lack of assessment of the impact on carbon and ecological footprint of individual policies, programmes and expenditure and their cumulative impact. Therefore, it is impossible for Welsh government to know whether its plans and programmes are sufficient to achieve the goals.



Speaking to delegates, Dr Alan Netherwood outlined the key findings of the report, which looked at what progress the Welsh Government has made in achieving a One Planet Wales:

He raised the question of whether the policy architecture set out in ‘One Wales, One Planet’ is right to deliver sustainability.

He stressed the importance of **documentary evidence** of a commitment to sustainable development, as it provides a framework for the Welsh Government and other organisations and gives a strong sense of Government accountability.

Is the Welsh Government living up to the aspiration of footprint reduction? The report drills right down into whether sustainability is being delivered, even on the level of regional transport strategies – for instance, what has been funded in transport in North Wales? It has been mainly roads with a small amount of rail.

Dr Netherwood highlighted **good examples** of footprint reduction:

Food and agriculture are exemplary areas where One Planet Wales had been embedded right down, as a result of fantastic Ministerial leadership. '[Food for Wales: Food From Wales](#)' and the [Farming Strategy](#) are excellent examples of forward thinking, well researched and evidenced policy.

Waste – Footprinting has been put at the centre of national and regional waste strategies and sectoral strategies.

He discussed **areas of concern**:

Sustainable travel towns – Policy intervention is not matching up to the scale needed. Policy hierarchy, including *Regional Transport Plans*, the *National Transport Plan* and capital programmes are failing to show how transport footprint reduction could be realised.

Public sector - There has been a huge shift following the Local Government Measure and opportunities to drive home the One Wales, One Planet agenda, but footprint was not part of the discourse.

Housing strategy – This does not include anything about One Planet. How are we to move towards a One Planet Wales if this is not taken into account?

'Economic Renewal: A New Direction'. One Planet Wales is absent from the Economic Renewal Programme. There is no mention of sustainable consumption and emissions reduction, despite there being a narrative for green jobs; this shows a lack of credibility.

Ministers must learn from what has worked, such as food and agriculture, and correct what has not, such as the Economic Renewal Programme.

Urgency and importance in Government – Is the Welsh Government's action on climate change urgent and important in their priorities?

There is no evidence that there is linking up within departments in Government on sustainability or that the cumulative effect of small measures adds up to what is required, and there is little activity for external engagement.

He suggested measuring footprint for all areas of policy, and making it part of performance management. The Welsh Government can compel this in the wider public sector through the Sustainability Bill.

We can make changes incrementally, or Wales can have a **route map**. The Sustainable Development Bill is a massive opportunity to create a plan in Wales that is different and that holds us to account.

Peter Roderick - New powers - the opportunity to deliver sustainable development

Peter Roderick has worked for the last twenty years in the UK and internationally as a public interest environmental lawyer. He recently published the [‘Discussion Document – the National Assembly for Wales taking the longer view’](#) for WWF Cymru, which he outlined at the conference.

Peter Roderick spoke to delegates about the potential for the National Assembly for Wales to use its new powers to make an impact on sustainable development challenges. He highlighted the ways the powers of the Assembly could be used to make an impact:

1. A legal foundation for sustainable development
2. Respecting environmental limits
3. Commissioner for Sustainable Futures
4. Welsh Charter of Environmental Rights

1. The duty to establish sustainability is really a duty to put forward a scheme as to how Ministers *propose* to tackle sustainable development. There is no example of a duty to *deliver* sustainability anywhere across the UK.

Peter Roderick suggested that there is the potential for a law that Ministers have a duty to exercise all of their powers for sustainable development. This could provide a lynch pin for making sustainable development **legally a centrally organising principle**. An important element of this would be in setting out a mechanism for resolving conflicts.

One reason sustainable development is so vague and hard to achieve is that it has never been written down. A **written definition** of sustainable development may present concerns about legal challenge, but courts would give a broad social and economic context to judgements. To put sustainable development in law as a precautionary principle that Ministers must abide by would make Wales a world leader.

2. The Welsh Government could lead by example to establish the nine earth system processes (e.g. land use, biodiversity loss) that we must respect to ensure the earth remains sustainable. A Commissioner could advise on what the planetary boundaries are and how Wales is impacting on these nine areas.

3. Role of the **Commissioner for Sustainable Futures**. Across the world there are broadly three models for the role of a Commissioner.

- An adviser inside the executive and a Ministerial appointment, as is the current system in Wales.
- Part of the legislature, linked to the law making process and primarily an adviser to the Assembly
- A Commissioner elected by a parliament with strong independence, real power and duties to champion the cause. This would demonstrate that politicians understand the importance of sustainable development. The role would include the function to complain to the Commissioner, with the ability of the Commissioner to ask the Environment Agency to intervene where there is an environmental problem.

Peter Roderick proposed that there could be a **Wales Charter of Environmental Rights** to recognise the right of people to live in a healthy environment, enforceable by law. These statutory rights would be an inspirational way of using the powers of the Assembly.

John Griffiths AM, Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development

The Minister outlined the new Welsh Government's priorities for the coming Assembly term.

The Minister stated that Government is often about pragmatism and what is achievable. It is important to have a ground swell of science and environmental opinion to provide the evidence base for Government policy, but it is important to bring people with us.

He said that in Government he has been keen to look at what impacts on people's everyday life in Wales, particularly poorer people.

When Government talks to people about frontline issues and behavioural change, it about what is perceived as 'mundane issues' – parks or litter for instance. Despite this, if you can show that you are taking forward frontline issues then you can show that you are engaged.

Lifestyle choice is a key factor. There is a need to make stronger connections with people in Wales.

There are many positives, such as with eco schools which educate young people and also enable children to educate their parents. People's behaviour has changed in recycling, for which Wales is on track. People across Wales have played their part in achieving this, and this willingness by the public to play their part will stand us in good stead.

Wales is not far off having a statutory sustainability duty, which has been important in focussing the minds of Ministers. The Minister said that there must be a scheme which is reported on annually and reviewed following every election, with the involvement of other organisations.

Looking forward, he said that the Government envisaged having a **statutory duty to sustainable development** as a central organising principle in decision making and in the wider public sector.

The wording and drafting of this legislation will take careful attention to have a real effect on the ground.

He expressed that it is important to have a body on the ground and an **independent commentary**, and that the role of the Commissioner for Sustainable Futures was important in taking this forward.

He paid tribute to the work of WWF Cymru, and said that it was the One Planet Wales report that sparked off much of the activity of the last Government by setting the agenda and debate and in guiding what the Government adopted. The work around ecological footprint is partly as a result of WWF Cymru's work.

Government is in no illusion that it is able to produce a silver bullet for sustainable development; it is a long term challenge.

He outlined that the legislation the Government has in mind will be crucial in furthering the One Planet agenda, and that if the Government is to get it right it will require people with experience to engage.

He said that it was difficult to show if legislation has achieved what it intended to, and referred to his wish as Counsel General to see wider engagement to ensure that legislation is fit for purpose.

The Minister concluded by **inviting organisations to engage with the Welsh Government** on future legislation that could be extremely important for the future of sustainable development in Wales.



Questions and Panel Discussion

Q - Dr Alan Netherwood: Regarding resource scarcity, what would success look like in Wales in ten years?

Will Day: We would leave it in the ground and find alternatives. The challenge is to move to electrification, which should be seen as a genuine opportunity. There is growing analysis that shows that Europe can be fully renewably powered in the future.

Q - Llywelyn Rhys (Head of RenewableUK Cymru): There is a gap in trust and confidence, and specifically on renewable energy with the protest in Welshpool where trust has broken down between people, the Welsh Government and the UK Government. How do we bridge that gap?

Peter Davies: We want to learn from the TAN 8 process. Developers say that the failure was engaging those communities - I have seen the figures that show that developments can bring the real benefit to those areas. We have let the debate run away - issues of transport and visuals should be more developed at the outset. There has been a failure of engagement and it is myth that fills that gap. This is a genuine issue at the moment.

Q - Simon Thomas AM: It is notable that the planning system in Wales is fragmented, and has allowed people to pass responsibility for decisions both ways along the M4 and at local authority.

Mutuals are trusted organisations, and there is an opportunity to develop some of those organisations. At the moment either huge developers or micro projects are the options we are presented with, but perhaps we could develop a community development model.

I understand that faced with a good wind source in Wales, we cannot stop onshore wind because it is the most viable line. Am I justified in thinking this?

Sir John Houghton: It is, but we must take into account other factors, for example public acceptance. We must not forget about other options, including tidal power. This must be looked at very hard.

Peter Davies: The new Assembly should be keeping the Severn Estuary absolutely on the agenda. Only the private sector is doing so.

Eryl Vaughan (Windpower Wales Ltd): We recognise that wind power only forms a part of the solution to the problem. We are in intense dialogue about where we go from here with the Welsh Government. I agree that there has been a lack of engagement with the public; we have failed to take people with us. There is a seminar on how we can deliver this engagement on 3rd August at 6.30pm at the Eisteddfod.

Q – Martin Jones (Cardiff University): What could be done to reduce the perceived cost of developments under TAN 8, and to increase the perceived benefits?

Will Day: there are two kinds of cost – a reduction in the amount that you are paying for your energy bill, or aesthetic cost, which is much more difficult to quantify. People don't realise that pylons are temporary structure that can be removed. They are an interim technology in my opinion, but at present we do need them.

Peter Davies: There is a marked difference in the approach of different local authorities in the level of public engagement. Some authorities have really looked at the benefits to the community of developments.

Q - Peter Jones (RSPB): Could there be a charter of rights for other species?

Peter Roderick: It would be difficult to establish rights for other species – how would the rights be formulated? The context of our systems is that it is a human system. However, consideration must extend to all forms of life without question.

Q - Will Day: The good news and bad news stories that are highlighted in the report on the Welsh Government's progress on One Planet wales – what are they down to?

Dr Alan Netherwood: It is down to Ministerial leadership. The messaging and discourse that is seeking to engage people is also incredibly important.

Peter Roderick: It is Assembly Members who determine how much scope Ministers have to manoeuvre. At the end of the day they are accountable to the people.

Peter Davies: It is my interpretation that it was not the Minister, but senior civil servants that made the difference. They hold the opinion that sustainable development gets in the way of doing business. It has taken a long time to get sustainability it into the mind of senior civil servants; they see it as a barrier to jobs. There is movement now; the Director General is responsible for sustainability.

Q - Haf Elgar (Friends of the Earth Cymru): Could there be a problem between the Assembly and Whitehall if the legislation to establish environmental rights for people applies only to devolved areas?

Peter Roderick: A law that relates to the environment is a law that the National Assembly can pass. The question would come in the detail and whether a problem arose based on who has made an environmental decision – if it is someone in Westminster then it clearly is not possible to apply the law. But there is a lot that the Assembly is able to do and that can be delivered.

Q - Llywelyn Rhys (RenewableUK): Policy based on vision and ambition does not amount to much, as we can just keep reviewing ambition. The Minister is right to link small behavioural change to the bigger picture, but it is not enough. Are we asking for bolder, faster action even if it means that politicians have to stick out their necks?

Anne Meikle (WWF Cymru): The Delivery Unit should play a role in delivering sustainable development.

Dr Alan Netherwood: We need to set it in local politicians' minds that energy price rises and plateaus have major consequences for the way they deliver frontline services. We need to get them engaged.

Sir John Houghton: It is an issue of timescale. The opportunities pay off better if we are at the front of the curve, but we are not doing at the moment. There is a real dragging of feet in Westminster and the Assembly but we must act or we will suffer in the long run. Getting round the table with government and getting the timescales for action are not forthcoming for businesses. The national Assembly should engage more readily with business needs.

Q - Anne Meikle: What are the barriers to change?

Peter Davies: The Climate Change Commission has met 17 times already, and most have been with the Minister in the chair. There is a meeting with the Minister next week, and there will be a report by the end of the year on how we are doing.

I attended a CBI meeting recently, and it is clear that we must engage with business. This is one area we have to address. The Climate Change Commission must be as outward looking as it is inward looking.

Will Day: We need to have statesmen not politicians. There needs to be real engagement, and we must recognise that it is a messy process effecting change.

Madeleine Havard (Environment Agency Wales): Things have changed hugely since the first report – we have had an economic crisis, a change of UK Government. Our Government is intending to deal very differently with things compared to Westminster; how can they work with Westminster and other governments on sustainable development?

Will Day: I think that the closure of the Sustainable Development Commission means that we have lost some of the baby with the bathwater. There is discussion between the Welsh Government and Westminster but it is with a long spoon and there is a low ebb in the relationship. This is a consequence of the misunderstanding of what can be offered; I despair about the breakdown of the relationship.

Dr Alan Netherwood: There is an opportunity with the merger of the Countryside Council for Wales and the Forestry Commission of setting clear water between England and Wales.

Will Day: Maybe we are missing a trick on a UK-wide approach.



Speakers' Biographies

Sir John Houghton FRS CBE

Sir John Theodore Houghton FRS CBE is an eminent and highly respected scientist who was the co-chair of the Nobel Peace Prize winning Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change's (IPCC) scientific assessment working group and lead editor of the first three IPCC reports. He was professor in atmospheric physics at the University of Oxford, former Chief Executive at the Met Office and founder of the Hadley Centre.

He is currently Honorary Scientist of the Hadley Centre for Climate Prediction and Research at the Meteorological Office; a Trustee of the Shell Foundation; and President of the John Ray Initiative. Previous appointments include:

- Member of the UK Government Panel on Sustainable Development (1994-2000)
- Chairman, Royal Commission on Environmental Pollution (1992-98)
- Director General (later Chief Executive), UK Meteorological Office (1983-91)
- Director Appleton, Science and Engineering Research Council (also Deputy Director, Rutherford Appleton Laboratory)(1979-83);
- Professor of Atmospheric Physics, Oxford University (1976-83)

During the 1970s he was also Principal Investigator for Space Experiments on NASA Spacecraft. He has been the recipient of numerous honours and awards including:

Japan Prize (2006), International Meteorological Organization Prize (1999), American Meteorological Society, Honorary Member (1998), Royal Astronomical Society Gold Medal (1995), Global 500 Award under the United Nations Environmental Programme (1994), Climate Institute Annual Award (1992), Bakerian Prize Lecture of the Royal Society, (1991), Symons Memorial Medal, Royal Meteorological Society (1991), Glazebrook Medal Institute of Physics (1990) and the Nobel Peace Prize as part of the UN Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) delegation, alongside the former vice-president of America, Al Gore (2007). In 2009, he received the Albert Einstein Science Award of the World Cultural Council.

Will Day

Will Day spent twenty years or so working with a range of relief and development NGOs (Save the Children, OXFAM, Opportunity Trust and CARE International) in Uganda, Kenya, Ethiopia, Sudan and Somalia. He was involved in the establishment of Comic Relief, a fundraising and grant making organisation, and as its first Grants Director was responsible for setting up its grants programme for Africa. As well as involvement in the production of Comic Relief's television and radio documentaries, he spent time as a producer and presenter for the BBC World Service for Africa. Until April 2011, he was Chairman of the UK Sustainable Development Commission.

He is currently Sustainability Advisor to Pricewaterhouse Coopers, and as a Senior Associate of the University of Cambridge Programme for Sustainability Leadership (CPSL), is a faculty member of the Prince of Wales's Business and Environment Programme as well as participating in CPI's other Senior Executive Education programmes on sustainability, held in the UK, Capetown, Nairobi, Abuja and Salzburg

He is Chairman of Water and Sanitation for the Urban Poor (WSUP), a non-profit company bringing together private sector and NGO member organisations to pursue the Millennium Development goal for

water and sanitation in the poorest parts of the world, and has been a Special Advisor to the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) since 2004.

Peter Davies, Commissioner for Sustainable Futures

Peter Davies was appointed Commissioner for Wales and Vice Chair of the UK Sustainable Development Commission in 2007, providing independent advice to the Welsh and UK Governments. Following the decision of the UK Government to cut the UK Commission, Peter was appointed as Wales' first Sustainable Futures Commissioner by the Welsh Government in April 2011. This role is supported by Cynnal Cymru – Sustain Wales, the sustainable development forum for Wales. Peter also was appointed as independent chair of the Climate Change Commission for Wales in 2010.

Dr Alan Netherwood, Netherwood Sustainable Futures

Dr. Alan Netherwood has worked for Cardiff Council, Environment Agency Wales, Cardiff University and voluntary bodies in the fields of sustainable development and climate change. For the past four years he has been running his own company Netherwood Sustainable Futures, working with a range of clients on sustainability and climate change initiatives including: Welsh Local Government Association; Welsh Assembly Government, BBC Wales, WWF Cymru, West Midlands Environment Network and the Sustainable Development Commission.

He co-authored the Sustainable Development Scheme Effectiveness Review in 2008. He is an Honorary Research Fellow in the Cardiff School of City and Regional Planning in Cardiff University exploring governance and sustainability and is also a Board Member of Sustain Wales: Cynnal Cymru. He has a 11 year old son, 4 year old daughter, and runs a 22 acre farm near Llandeilo with his partner. With a Better Woodlands for Wales grant they will be planting 2500 trees over the next 2 years to help reduce the footprint of the family, the farm and their business interests.

Peter Roderick

Peter Roderick is an environmental lawyer based in the UK. After qualifying and practising as a barrister, he joined Shell International, working in London and South-east Asia on a wide range of legal issues affecting an international oil company (1985-1991). Concerned about climate change, he left Shell in 1991, went back to university to study environmental law, and has worked for the last twenty years or so, in the UK and internationally, as a public interest environmental lawyer.

Over this time, he has worked on a broad range of environmental issues with an equally broad range of organisations and individuals, including on: the European Energy Charter, with Greenpeace International; toxic waste regulation, with the Government of Bangladesh; road building, with protesters living in trees; genetically modified organisms and the Aarhus Convention negotiations, with Friends of the Earth, where he was the in-house lawyer in London from 1996-2001; climate change litigation, as co-Director of the Climate Justice Programme which he co-founded with German lawyer Roda Verheyen, from 2001-2010; and on renewable energy feed-in tariff laws and future justice issues, with the World Future Council.

He is a joint editor of the book 'Improving Compliance with International Environmental Law', and of the recent report for WWF-UK and the Foundation for Democracy and Sustainable Development entitled 'Taking the longer view: UK governance options for a finite planet'.

John Griffiths AM, Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development

Born in 1956, John Griffiths studied law as a mature student at the University of Wales, Cardiff before going on to practice as a solicitor specialising in criminal law, personal injury and general civil litigation. He is a former Councillor on Gwent County Council and Newport County Borough Council. He is a member of the Co-operative Party and the Community and Unite Trades Unions.

John has previously served as Deputy Minister for Economic Development, Deputy Minister within the Health and Social Services portfolio having special responsibility for Older People and Deputy Minister for Skills. In December 2009, he was appointed as Counsel General and Leader of the Legislative Programme. Following re-election to the National Assembly for Wales in May 2011, John Griffiths was appointed Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development

Anne Meikle, Head of WWF Cymru

Anne Meikle is Head of WWF Cymru. Born in Scotland, Anne trained as a psychologist. She became a manager at a multi-national paper company and worked for the Brecon Beacons National Park. However, her passionate interest in conservation and wildlife drew her to WWF. As Head of WWF in Wales she leads the team and represents WWF in the media and with our partners in Wales. Backed by the policy and communications resources of the Welsh staff and UK organisations, she seeks to influence decision-makers on issues such as marine legislation, sustainable development and climate change.

Links

- **‘Progress in embedding the ‘One Planet’ aspiration in Welsh Government’ - Report for WWF Cymru by Dr Alan Netherwood -**
assets.wwf.org.uk/downloads/main_report_progress_in_embedding_the_one_planet_aspiration_in_welsh_government.pdf
- **Summary Report: Delivering a One Planet Wales: Is the Welsh Government delivering a One Planet, low carbon Wales? - Dr Alan Netherwood -**
assets.wwf.org.uk/downloads/summary_report_is_the_welsh_government_delivering_a_one_planet_low_carbon_wales.pdf
- **Discussion Document: The National Assembly for Wales taking the longer view - Peter Roderick –**
assets.wwf.org.uk/downloads/discussion_document_by_peter_roderick_the_national_assembly_for_wales_and_taking_th.pdf

